

Public Document Pack

Planning Committee

Thursday 7 January, 2010

PRESENT:

Councillor Lock, in the Chair.

Councillor Mrs. Stephens, Vice-Chair.

Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Delbridge, M. Foster (substitute for Councillor Thompson), Fox, Mrs. Nicholson (substitute for Councillor Nicholson), Roberts, Stevens, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler.

Apologies for absence: Councillors Nicholson and Thompson.

The meeting started at 2.30 p.m. and finished at 4.45 p.m.

Note: At a future meeting, the committee will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.

69. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following declarations of interest were made in accordance with the Code of Conduct in relation to items under discussion at this meeting –

Name	Minute No. and Subject	Reason	Interest
Councillor Roberts	73.6 – Widewell Primary School, Lulworth Drive, Plymouth 09/01496/PRDE	Ward Councillor	Personal
Councillor Stevens	73.10 – Land at 1-56 Raglan Road, Plymouth 09/01565/FUL	Spoken on previous application for similar development	Prejudicial

70. MINUTES

Resolved that the minutes of the meeting held of 10 December, 2009, be confirmed as a correct record, subject to the following amendment –

Minute 65.1 – the deletion of the footnote relating to the declaration of personal interests made by Councillors Stevens, Tuohy and Wheeler.

Minute 65.2 – the addition of the footnote relating to the declaration of personal interests made by Councillors Stevens, Tuohy and Wheeler.

71. CHAIR'S URGENT BUSINESS

Application No. 09/01302/FUL – 1 St. Lawrence Road and 14 Houndiscombe Road, Plymouth

The Chair advised Committee that, as a result of inaccuracies having been identified within the application, officers now wished to amend their recommendation so that the could be deferred for further consideration.

Resolved that the item be moved higher up the agenda for consideration immediately after the applications submitted by staff.

(In accordance with Section 100(B)(4)(b) of the Local Government Act, 1972, the Chair brought forward the above item of business because of the need to inform Committee Members and seek a decision).

72. **QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC**

There were no questions from members of the public.

73. **PLANNING APPLICATIONS FOR CONSIDERATION**

The Committee considered the following planning applications, development proposals by local authorities and statutory consultations submitted under the Town and Country Planning Act, 1990, and the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act, 1990.

Addendum reports were submitted in respect of minute numbers 73.1, 73.2, 73.3, 73.4, 73.5, 73.6, 73.9 and 73.10.

73.1 LAND REAR OF 12 ELFORD DRIVE, ORESTON, PLYMOUTH 09/01681/FUL
(Mr. Peter Tracey and Ms. Julie McDonagh)

Decision:
Application **GRANTED** conditionally.

73.2 LAND REAR OF 10 ELFORD DRIVE, ORESTON, PLYMOUTH 09/01682/FUL
(Mr. Peter Tracey and Ms. Julie McDonagh)

Decision:
Application **GRANTED** conditionally.

73.3 35 LYNWOOD AVENUE, PLYMPTON, PLYMOUTH 09/01712/FUL
(Mr. N. Harman)

Decision:
Application **GRANTED** conditionally.

73.4 34 DOWNHAM GARDENS, TAMERTON FOLIOT, PLYMOUTH 09/01696/FUL
(Mr. K. Pethick)

Decision:
Application **GRANTED** conditionally, with the addition of two extra conditions (3) and (4) as set out within the addendum report.

73.5 1 ST. LAWRENCE ROAD AND 14 HOUNDISCOMBE ROAD, PLYMOUTH
09/01302/FUL

(Mr. Dave Hendy)
Decision:
Application **DEFERRED** for further consideration.

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations against the application).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations in support of the application on behalf of the applicant).

73.6 WIDEWELL PRIMARY SCHOOL, LULWORTH DRIVE, PLYMOUTH
09/01496/PRDE

(Mr. James Welsh)
Decision:
Application **MINDED TO REFUSE.***

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations against the application).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations in support of the application on behalf of the applicant).

(Councillor Roberts declared a personal interest in respect of the above item).

*Having initially voted against the officer's recommendation to Grant Conditionally (see voting schedule annexed to these minutes), the Committee accepted the officer's proposal to be Minded to Refuse and subsequently changed its vote in order to provide the opportunity for further examples of case law to be studied.

73.7 DRIFT COTTAGE, BORINGDON ROAD, TURNCHAPEL, PLYMOUTH
09/01293/FUL
(Mr. M. Wixey)
Decision:
Application **GRANTED** conditionally.

73.8 DRIFT COTTAGE, BORINGDON ROAD, TURNCHAPEL, PLYMOUTH
09/01294/CAC
(Mr. M. Wixey)
Decision:
Application **GRANTED** conditionally.

73.9 LAND AT PLEASURE HILL CLOSE, PLYMOUTH 09/01235/FUL
(Donson Ltd.)
Decision:
Application **REFUSED**.

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations against the application).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations in support of the application on behalf of the applicant).

73.10 LAND AT 1-56 RAGLAN ROAD, PLYMOUTH 09/01565/FUL
(Risesign Ltd.)
Decision:
Application **REFUSED**.

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from Councillor Stevens, Ward Member, speaking against the application. Having declared a prejudicial interest in respect of the matter, he then withdrew from the meeting).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations against the application).

74. **PLANNING APPLICATION DECISIONS ISSUED**

The Committee received a report of the Assistant Director of Development (Planning Services) on decisions issued for the period 10 to 18 December, 2009, including –

- Committee decisions
- Delegated decisions, subject to conditions where so indicated
- Applications withdrawn
- Applications returned as invalid

Resolved that the report be noted.

75. **APPEAL DECISIONS**

The Committee received a schedule of decisions made by the Planning Inspectorate on appeals arising from the decisions of the City Council.

Resolved that the report be noted.

76. **EXEMPT BUSINESS**

There were no items of exempt business.

SCHEDULE OF VOTING (Pages 1 - 2)

PLEASE NOTE

A SCHEDULE OF VOTING RELATING TO THE MEETING IS ATTACHED AS A SUPPLEMENT TO THESE MINUTES.

PLANNING COMMITTEE

DATE OF MEETING – 7 January, 2010

SCHEDULE OF VOTING

Minute No.	Voting For	Voting Against	Abstained	Excluded from voting due to Interests Declared	Absent
73.1 Land rear of 12 Elford Drive, Oreston, Plymouth 09/01681/FUL Officer's recommendation	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Delbridge, M. Foster, Fox, Lock, Roberts, Mrs. Stephens, Stevens, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler.				Councillor Mrs. Nicholson
73.2 Land rear of 10 Elford Drive, Oreston, Plymouth 09/01682/FUL Officer's recommendation	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Delbridge, M. Foster, Fox, Lock, Roberts, Mrs. Stephens, Stevens, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler.				Councillor Mrs. Nicholson
73.3 35 Lynwood Avenue, Plympton, Plymouth 09/01712/FUL Officer's recommendation	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Delbridge, M. Foster, Fox, Lock, Roberts, Mrs. Stephens, Stevens, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler.				Councillor Mrs. Nicholson
73.4 34 Downham Gardens, Tamerton Foliot, Plymouth 09/01696/FUL Officer's recommendation	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Delbridge, M. Foster, Fox, Lock, Roberts, Mrs. Stephens, Stevens, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler.				Councillor Mrs. Nicholson
73.5 1 St. Lawrence Road and 14 Houndiscombe Road, Plymouth 09/01302/FUL Officer's amended recommendation	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Delbridge, M. Foster, Fox, Lock, Roberts, Mrs. Stephens, Stevens, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler.				Councillor Mrs. Nicholson
73.6 Widewell Primary School, Lulworth Drive, Plymouth 09/01496/PRDE Officer's recommendation (as per report)	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Lock, Mrs. Stephens and Wheeler.	Councillors Delbridge, M. Foster, Fox, Roberts, Stevens, Tuohy and Vincent.	Councillor Mrs. Nicholson		
Officer's amended recommendation (see minute)*	Councillors Delbridge, M. Foster, Fox,	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Lock and Mrs. Stephens.	Councillors Mrs. Nicholson		

Minute No.	Voting For	Voting Against	Abstained	Excluded from voting due to Interests Declared	Absent
	Roberts, Stevents, Tuohy and Vincent.		and Wheeler.		
73.7 Drift Cottage, Boringdon Road, Turnchapel, Plymouth 09/01293/FUL Officer's recommendation	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, M. Foster, Fox, Lock, Mrs. Nicholson, Roberts, Mrs. Stephens, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler.				Councillors Delbridge and Stevens.
73.8 Drift Cottage, Boringdon Road, Turnchapel, Plymouth 09/01294/CAC Officer's recommendation	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, M. Foster, Fox, Lock, Mrs. Nicholson, Roberts, Mrs. Stephens, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler.				Councillors Delbridge and Stevens.
73.9 Land at Pleasure Hill Close, Plymouth 09/01235/FUL Officer's recommendation	Unanimous.				
73.10 Land at 1-56 Raglan Road, Plymouth 09/01565/FUL	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Delbridge, M. Foster, Fox, Lock, Mrs. Nicholson, Mrs. Stephens, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler.			Councillor Stevens	Councillor Roberts